

Meritocracy In Placement Of Civil Servants In Structural Positions Of Baubau City Government

Mahyudin¹, Akmal Ibrahim¹, Muhammad Tang Abdullah¹, Suryadi Lambali¹

¹Public Administration, Faculty of Social and Political Science, Hasanuddin University, Makassar, Indonesia,

The selection of high-ranking leadership positions is actually an effort to manage human resources based on a merit system so that the best candidates can be placed in strategic positions that are in accordance with their respective fields of expertise. The merit system is a personnel management system that prioritizes competence as the basis for consideration for prospective government officials. Prospective government officials must have expertise and professionalism in accordance with the needs of the position they will hold later, in accordance with the interpretation of the candidate's competence. Competence, expertise, and professionalism are factors considered when selecting candidates for certain positions in government. In this study, the researcher focused on finding the best candidates according to the applicable merit system starting from the preparation stage, implementation stage and results stage. The study used a qualitative approach with a case study research type. Qualitative research is a method used to research natural object conditions (as opposed to experiments) where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are carried out by triangulation (combination). The focus of this study is meritocracy in the placement of civil servants in structural positions in the Baubau city government which includes elements, namely the best candidates. In the research, the stages to determine the best candidate for the placement of the High Leadership Position in the Baubau City Government are the preparation stage, the implementation stage and the results stage. First, the preparation stage for the formation of the Selection Committee, which is seen in the members of the Selection Committee often being filled by Chancellors at several Baubau City universities who have not shown their scientific representation for the position to be selected. The implementation stage consists of several parts of the activity, namely the announcement of the JPT selection which has not been massively published so that many employees have not participated in the JPT selection process, the existence of an administrative selection process for officials which is adjusted to the provisions of the selection schedule. The results stage, namely the selection committee announces 3 (three) big names who passed the selection results, then stated in the Selection Committee Decree regarding the results of the open selection of the Baubau City Government's Pratama High Leadership Position. The three names that passed in several agencies within the City Government were found to still have spoil system practices, where there is a family relationship between the Mayor and the top 3 participants. Likewise, the determination of JPT as the best candidate by the PPK (Mayor of Baubau) does not reflect the overall system of merit such as the assessment of qualifications, competence and performance.

Keywords: Meritocracy, Civil Servant Placement, Structural Positions.

Introduction

Bureaucratic Reform is very important for the development of a civilization, starting from public organizations at the Ministry/Institution level to the Regional Government level. In practice, institutionalizing the Bureaucratic Reform movement requires a qualified Management System that documents knowledge, experience, and information about bureaucratic reform and distributes it to all parties in need. It is also necessary to exchange knowledge, examples, and experiences in the institutional reform movement between institutions, actors, and synergy between the center and regions (Dwiyanto, 2015). Bureaucratic reform is also important to fix the bureaucracy that has been plagued by pathology. The impact or consequences of bureaucratic reform itself are one of the obstacles that are still faced in the development of bureaucratic reform because the government is still afraid to take and bear the risks later. Bureaucratic reform is actually quite complicated and risky because it concerns issues of habits, apparatus, and work systems in service (Yusriadi, 2018). Employee placement, on the other hand, must be adjusted to the proposed formation. However, it is common knowledge that employee appointments are made not based on employee competence but political factors such as closeness to policy makers (Nugroho et al., 2020).

One important part of the Bureaucratic Reform agenda in Indonesia is the implementation of a merit system in filling or promoting structural positions. This is contained in the Grand Design of Indonesian Bureaucratic Reform which is directed at the transformation of the policy and management system of the State Civil Apparatus (ASN) from a Closed Career System to an Open Career System, the transformation of personnel administration to human resource management and development of Human Capital potential, and the transformation from Rule Based Bureaucracy to Performance Based Bureaucracy and Dynamic Governance. This change in ASN management is expected to accelerate the implementation of bureaucratic reform as a whole. Law Number 5 of 2014 concerning State Civil Apparatus, mandates that KASN has a supervisory function for the implementation of basic norms, code of ethics, and code of conduct for State Civil Apparatus (hereinafter referred to as ASN), as well as the application of a merit system in ASN policies and management in government agencies. In the concept of human resource management, this law is considered an approach to developing human capital potential to realize the vision of realizing world-class governance (Aulawi, 2015) with the mission of (1) forming/perfecting laws and regulations in order to realize good governance; (2) structuring and strengthening the organization, procedures, management of human resources and apparatus, supervision, accountability, quality of public services, mind set and culture set; (3) developing effective control mechanisms; and (4) managing administrative disputes effectively and efficiently.

The application of the merit system principle in structural positions is important because it is one of the main keys to success in employee management and development (Wahyudin and Sudarno, 2018). Therefore, in order to fill structural positions, a leader must be able to develop the optimal potential of his subordinates appropriately and correctly, assess the readiness and abilities of subordinates, so that the placement process in structural positions truly adheres to the merit system, namely based on certain skills, abilities or expertise according to the level of his position. In practice, the application of meritocracy in the recruitment policy for the placement of civil servants in structural positions is very difficult to implement.

Job auctions are a phenomenon in which prospective officials or employees who want to occupy a position in an institution or agency make a price offer or contribution in any form to the authorized official to select the official or employee who will be accepted in that position. This phenomenon generally occurs in Indonesia and is often controversial because it is considered a form of corruption and a violation of ethics in public services.

Baubau City is located in Southeast Sulawesi Province, Indonesia, also experiencing the phenomenon of job auctions (job promotions). Several cases of job auctions that have occurred in this city include the auction of the positions of Principal, Head of Service, Head of Agency, and other positions in the government sector. Since the issuance of Law No. 5 of 2014 concerning the Merit System with open selection for filling Jobs/Job Promotions, Baubau City has only implemented the Law in 2016. According to the Secretary of the BPKPSDM Service of Baubau City "According to the author's observations, Baubau City has several departments where only one person has registered, for example the Baubau City Regional Development Planning Agency, which is only filled by one person. The author tried to do a search and it turned out that the person concerned was part of the Mayor's relatives. In addition, there are also several departments where the same thing happened, but in order to meet the requirements, the person concerned told his colleagues to register later, the administration fee will be borne by the person concerned. In addition, the lack of transparency from the selection committee regarding the job auction process raises doubts whether the job auction carried out by the Baubau City Government is the best candidate from all participants, as conveyed by one of the heads of the Division at the Human Resources Management Development and Personnel Office, that "regarding the transparency of this job auction, everything is returned to the Pansel (Selection Committee) which is entrusted to carry out the job auction, it's just that there was a Pansel in 2020 that was less transparent, so that the public had time to wonder why suddenly there was a head of the department." According to the author's observations, that indeed out of a total of 5 job auctions carried out in Baubau City, there were 2 job auctions, the Pansel rarely socialized the job auction activities, so that the promotion process through this job auction seemed to be hidden, this was caused according to the author because the Pansel formed each time the job auction had different members.

One of the purposes of holding a job auction is to find employees who are competent, have integrity and are professional in their work. The job auction process to find the best candidates must of course be selected from the many participants who take part in the job auction. It's just that if not many people participate in the job auction, the process of finding the best candidates will not run professionally. Because according to the author's observations, there are several agencies that only register 3 people, there is 1 agency that registers 4 people, and there are even several agencies that do not meet the participant quota at all, so the registration must be extended. Especially if you see that those who register are the families of local officials.

Several names from the auction process are the Mayor's family who will of course greatly affect the quality of the job auction, because the selection committee only produces 3 names, then the determination is returned to the PPK (Personnel Development Officer) to choose one name to be inaugurated as the head of the OPD.

This job auction phenomenon is very detrimental to the community and public services because it places officials who are not necessarily competent or do not have adequate qualifications in important positions, and also creates opportunities for officials to enrich themselves. In addition, this phenomenon also damages the meritocratic system which should be the basic principle in the recruitment of officials or employees in the government sector because it is dominated by family relationships.

Based on the phenomena that have been described previously, the author feels the need to conduct research related to meritocracy in job placement. Considering that meritocracy and job placement are two things that are closely related in the context of human resource management and government in Baubau City. Job auction is a system of filling positions that is carried out by opening opportunities to anyone who meets the requirements to apply as a candidate for an official. The best candidate for an official is then selected through an open and fair selection process, so that it is hoped that people who meet the qualifications, have the competence, and have the appropriate experience to fill the position will be selected. Bau has only carried out job auctions/promotion selection for filling positions 5 times, namely in 2016, 2017, 2020, 2022, and 2023. Based on this background, the formulation of the problem in this research is as follows, namely how to find the best candidate for placement in structural positions in the Baubau city government.

Literature Review

Human Resource Management Concept

Maximizing the resources owned by the organization according to knowledge and skills for the implementation of government tasks as conveyed by Rushadi (2011:14) that resources are all forms of input that can produce utility (benefit) of the production process or provision of goods and services. Something can be said to be a resource if humans have/mastered the technology to utilize it and there is a demand to utilize it. Resources have a rare nature (scarcity) and have utility through a production activity through the provision of goods and services.

Furthermore, according to Jerry W. Gilley and Steven A. Eggland (1995), Human resources are learning activities/activities to organize in an organization to develop Improve achievement and/or personal with the aim of developing work, individuals and/or organizations. Human resources have a greater impact on organizational effectiveness than other resources. How well human resources are managed will determine the success of the organization in the future.

Pynes (2009) stated that activities that are often associated with human resource management include: "...recruitment, selection, training and development, compensation and benefits, retention, evaluation, and promotion..." This is also in line with the opinion of Bernardin and Russell (1993,), who stated that human resource management includes: "...recruitment, selection, development, compensation, retention, evaluation, and promotion..." Schuler (1992), stated that human resource management strategies can be associated with the concepts of philosophy, policy, program, practices, and process (known as 5P). The concept of 5P includes; (1) Human Resource Philosophy, a statement that reflects the organizational culture

and business values that will be applied in treating employees; (2) Human Resource Policy, namely values that are shared and become instructions or guidelines for determining decisions and managing activities related to employees; (3) Human Resource Programs, namely strategies that aim to coordinate various efforts to facilitate human change in the organization; (4) Human Resource Practices, namely the operationalization of leadership, managerial and operational roles that aim to motivate employees to behave as expected and; (5) Human Resource Process, namely regulating how to identify, formulate and implement programs in the field of personnel.

The 5P concept can show the interrelationship between activities in human resource management. Pynes (2009) states that activities that are often associated with human resource management include: "...recruitment, selection, training and development, compensation and benefits, retention, evaluation, and promotion..."

Concept of Merit

The concept of meritocracy was popularized by Michael Young in his book "The Rise of the Meritocracy" quoted by Daniels 1978 in Nurprojo (2014) stating that in a broad sense it is interpreted as a social order built around a particularly notion of merit, which he admitted can anticipate various ideal social traits (in Setyowati, 2014). To understand the meaning between merit and meritocracy, Jedawi (2010) explains that merit is interpreted as an individual characteristic ("merit" is a characteristic of individuals, "meritocracy" is a characteristic of societies as a whole) while meritocracy is a characteristic of society as a whole which refers to the social system as a whole where individuals advance and receive direct rewards according to their individual efforts and abilities. Thus, meritocracy can be implemented if there is a mechanism called a merit system. Currently, meritocracy is often used as a positive connotation to describe a social system that allows people to achieve success in proportion to their talents and abilities, in contrast to those that use social class or wealth as controlling factors, as stated by Alvarado (2010) as follows:

According to Willy Mccourt (2007) the merit system must get "the best person" an organization can apply the following steps in conducting selection, namely: (1) Job at every level, meaning that the principle of merit applies to job promotions and initial recruitment for new employees (merit principle applies as much to promotion as to initial recruitment). In this case it is clearly stated that every level of work applies the principle of merit; (2) The best candidate, meaning that the best candidate is proven to be the most capable among a number of candidates to complete his job duties properly (demonstratively the most able among a number of candidates, any of whom could do the job adequately). Those who achieve the most and have the best competence in their fields are the best candidates; (3) Open to all, meaning that the appointment/filling of positions does not only rely on internal candidate sources or is based on a limited number of candidates. This principle requires fairness and equity, where all parties have the right to get the same opportunity; (4) Systematic, transparent and challengeable, meaning that all appointment decisions can be questioned, including for unsuccessful candidates, because in principle all these questions are very valuable feedback to improve appointment decisions for the future.

Methods

This study uses a qualitative approach with a case study type of research. Qualitative research is a method used to research natural object conditions, (as opposed to experiments) where the researcher is the key instrument, data collection techniques are carried out by triangulation (combination), data analysis is inductive and the results of qualitative research emphasize more on meaning than generalization (Miles and Huberman, 2014). This involves the discovery or interpretation of facts from the facts studied and makes it easier for the author to obtain objective data to analyze and understand the concept of meritocracy in the placement of civil servants in structural positions in the Baubau City Government with aspects of positions at all levels, the best candidates, open to all, systematic and transparent.

Results and Discussion

The merit system is a system that emphasizes three main things, namely qualifications, competence and performance in the assessment and development of ASN careers. According to Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017, filling or promoting JPT through competitive open selection in government agencies must be carried out by the selection committee through the stages of administrative selection, tracking track records, competency tests, final interviews, health and mental tests (Article 120 of Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management).

In general, filling or promoting JPT based on merit through open selection JPT is carried out through three main stages which are references in the merit system which can be seen in the following table, namely

Table 1. Stages of selection for filling/promotion of senior leadership positions

Preparation	Implementation	Result
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Notification to Kemenpan RB and KASN 2. Formation of selection committee 3. Preparation of selection guidelines 4. Preparation of JPT competency standards 5. Preparation of JPT selection assessment guidelines 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Announcement of JPT Selection 2. Administrative selection of Officials 3. Announcement of administrative selection results 4. Substance test 5. Announcement of substance test results 6. Paper preparation test 7. Announcement of paper test results 8. Interview test 9. Announcement of interview results 	<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Three JPT candidates are submitted to the Civil Service Development Officer. 2. Determination of JPT by the PPK (Personnel Development Officer)

Based on the table, the process of finding the best candidate in the merit system uses 3 important stages, namely the preparation stage, the implementation stage and the results stage. While at the level of policy objectives, the procedure for filling or promoting JPT as stipulated in Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 in general seems to have a good aim, namely to produce competent officials who are able to carry out their duties. More firmly regulated in principle in article 176 of Government Regulation Number 11 of 2017 concerning Civil Servant Management. This procedure is the application of a merit system in career development that emphasizes qualifications, competence, performance and government needs..

Preparation Stage

At this stage, the Baubau city government, in this case BKPSDM, wrote to Kemenpan RB and KASN regarding notification of the implementation of the Baubau City Government Job Promotion according to the needs and vacancies of echelon II positions due to retirement and transfer. This was conveyed by the Head of Development and Training who said that:

"The process of implementing job promotions is carried out because of the demands of organizational needs with several vacancies in echelon II positions so that it is very necessary to fill these positions by holding promotions for high-ranking leaders in one budget year." (Interview with the Head of Development and Training BKPSDM Baubau City).

Based on the interview, it can be seen that the merit system process with the promotion of the Echelon II High Leadership Position was implemented because of the vacancy of the position due to retirement and mutation, so it was deemed necessary to carry out a job promotion in accordance with the available laws and regulations. Based on the Decree of the Mayor of Baubau Number 493 / IV / 2023 concerning the Selection Committee for the High Leadership Position of Pratama Baubau City in 2023 which involved 5 Selection Committee members in the competency test of the high leadership officials of Pratama Baubau City with a composition of representatives of the Regional Government bureaucracy of 2 people, namely Sitti Munawar, S.STP., M.Si as Acting Regional Secretary of Baubau City and Ir. Wa Ode Muhibbah Suryani, M.Sc. as Head of BKPSDM Baubau City, and representatives of 3 universities, namely Ir. H.L.M. Syamsul Qamar, MT, IPU, Dr. Wa Ode Al Zarliani, SP., MM (Rector of Muhammadiyah University of Buton), and Dr. Sudjiton, MM (Rector of Muslim University of Buton). For more details, please see the following table:

Table 2. List of Selection Committee for High-Level Leadership Positions of Baubau City in 2023

No	Name	Position	Positions in the Selection Committee
1	Sitti Munawar,S.STP.,M.Si	Acting Regional Secretary of Baubau City	Chairman concurrently Member
2	Ir. Wa Ode Muhibbah Suryani,M.Si.	Head of BKPSDM Baubau City	Secretary concurrently Member

3	Ir.H.L.M. Syamsul Qamar,MT,IPU	Rector of Dayanu Ikhsanuddin University Baubau	Member
4	Dr. Wa Ode Al Zarliani,SP.,MM	Rector of Muhammadiyah University of Buton	Member
5	Dr.Sudjiton,MM	Rector of Muslim University of Buton	Member

Source: Baubau City BKPSDM Office, 2024.

Based on the table, it can be said that there is a division of the composition of the 2023 selection committee, namely 2 people from the local government and 3 people represented by academics. The 3 academic representatives are Chancellors from 3 campuses in Baubau City. According to the author's observation, the composition of academics in the 2023 selection committee structure does not reflect expertise in the field of science on bureaucracy and government because those appointed from academic representatives are Chancellors of University Institutions, not from academics who are purely in the field of expertise and science. . This is as conveyed by the Head of BKPSD Baubau City that:

"The formation of this selection committee has been coordinated by KASN and the names are the results of recommendations from KASN according to our proposal. So the purpose of the formation of the selection committee is to produce officials who can lead their services well and professionally, that's what we hope for." (interview with the Head of BKPSDM Baubau City)

Based on the interview, the target of the selection committee formation is to test the leadership and management of echelon 2 officials so that they can carry out their duties together with other employees to realize the vision and mission of the Baubau City Government. According to the author's observation, the formation of the selection committee is in accordance with the expertise and expertise in the fields of government and bureaucracy so that it can be understood how to move the bureaucracy with various dynamics and challenges. Likewise, the 2024 Selection Committee can be seen in the following table :

Table 3. List of Selection Committee for High-Level Leadership Positions of Baubau City in 2024

No	Name	Position	Positions in the Selection Committee
1	La Ode Aswad,S.Sos.,M.Si	Assistant for Government and Public Welfare of the Regional Secretariat of Baubau City	Chairman concurrently Member
2	Ir. Wa Ode Muhibbah Suryani,M.Si	Head of BKPSDM of Baubau City	Secretary concurrently Member
3	Ir.H.L.M. Syamsul Qamar,MT,IPU	Rector of Dayanu Ikhsanuddin University of Baubau	Member

4	Dr. Wa Ode Al Zarliani,SP.,MM	Rector of Muhammadiyah University of Buton	Member
5	Hardin Laomo,SE	Professional	Member

Source: BKPSDM Baubau City

Based on the table, the composition of the Selection Team is the same as before, namely that the selection team was formed only to represent the rectors of each university, not to reflect knowledge and expertise in the field of bureaucracy and government..

Implementation Stage

Once formed, the Selection Committee will work in accordance with the established regulations starting from the announcement, acceptance of application files, assessment, tracking of track records and until the selection committee produces 3 names to be sent to KASN for approval. For more details, please see the following table. :

Table 4. Open Selection Stages

No.	Activity	Time
1.	Announcement	May 22 – June 5, 2023
2.	Receipt of applications and required files	May 22 – June 5, 2023
3.	Administrative selection	June 6, 2023
4.	Announcement of administrative selection	June 7, 2023
5.	Assessment	June 12 – 13, 2023
6.	Tracking of track records	June 19 – 21, 2023
7.	Papers	June 22 – 23, 2023
8.	Final interviews	
9.	Health tests	
10.	Determination of open selection results	June 26, 2023
11.	Announcement of open selection results	June 28, 2023
12.	Submission of open selection results to the Mayor through the Acting Regional Secretary	June 28, 2023
13.	Submission of selection result reports to KASN to obtain recommendations before the inauguration	June 30, 2023

Source: Regional Civil Service and Training Agency of Baubau City, 2024

Based on the table, there are 13 points that need to be considered in the stages of implementing the promotion of high-ranking leadership positions, namely starting from the announcement to the submission of the selection results report to KASN to get recommendations before the inauguration.

Among the points that were produced, the one that received attention was the tracing of track records by the selection committee. According to one informant, namely a participant in the 2022 open selection, stated that:

"For this track record, we fill in the biodata that is available during the filing, then the paper that we submit also seems to review our track record a little. So from the 2 files, our track record was traced with only a few questions related to previous leadership, what we have been and so on. Yes, we provide answers according to what we know about that track record. " (Interview with one of the open selection participants)

Based on the interview, the tracing of the track record of a prospective echelon II official is only based on the papers and files submitted by the open selection participants. Without a single application or employee database regarding the track record of the prospective Echelon II official concerned. So it seems that the process of tracing the track record is just a file without any other instruments that strengthen the tracing of the track record.

Track record is very important because at the track record sub-stage a prospective official will be investigated to what extent their behavior, attitudes and decisions and benefits for the organization or other interests. So that at this track record sub-stage, sometimes many participants fall or do not pass to the next stage due to decisions or actions taken in the past. This was confirmed by an informant, namely the open selection committee in 2023, the rector of Umu Buton, who said that:

"Related to this track record, we know that each candidate has a different track record, I myself have been in the bureaucracy for a long time so I know all of their track records. But, for the selection committee, I am a selection committee so the search is through the papers submitted to us, there we dig up their track records through the papers submitted to us. So there is nothing else we use the paper with the CV too. That's all, we already know that too. " (interview with the selection committee for the rector of Umu Buton).

In line with the interview, it can be ascertained that the search for the track record of prospective participants in the open selection for promotion to high-ranking positions is only through a paper submitted to the selection committee. The paper instrument is the only instrument for conducting a track record search for prospective participants in the open selection for promotion to high-ranking positions in the Baubau city government from 2016 to 2023.

Results stage

After going through the implementation stage, the next step is to enter the results stage. At this stage, the Mayor of Baubau will determine 3 candidates produced by the Selection Committee. Furthermore, the Personnel Development Officer (PPK) in this case the Mayor of Baubau will determine one best candidate to be inaugurated as an echelon II official. To determine one candidate participant born by the mayor, the following are the names of the candidate participants recommended by the Mayor of Baubau in the open selection for job promotion from 2016 to 2024, which can be seen in the following table :

Table 5. List of Candidates for the Choice of Mayor of Baubau in the Selection of High Leadership Positions in 2016 – 2024

Year	Positions Up for Auction	Baubau Mayoral Election Candidates
2016	Head of Culture and Tourism Office of Baubau City.	Drs. Ali Arham,M.MP
	Head of Marine and Fisheries Office of Baubau City.	Drs. Amirudin,M.Si
	Expert Staff for Government Affairs of the Regional Secretariat of Baubau City.	Drs. Rahmat Tuta,M.Si
2017	Regional Secretary of Baubau City.	Dr. Roni Muhtar,M.Pd
2020	Head of BKPSDM Baubau City.	Abdul Rahman,S.Pd.,M.Si.
	Head of Trade and Industry Office of Baubau City.	La Ode Ali Hasan,SE.,M.Si.
	Head of Fisheries Office of Baubau City.	Drs. Ruslan RZ.,M.Si
	Head of National Unity and Politics Agency of Baubau City.	Drs. Muhammad Amaludin,M.Si.
	Assistant for Economy and Development.	Ibnu Wahid,ST.,MM
2022	Head of the Youth and Sports Department of Baubau City.	Dr.Mohammad Tasdik,SH.,M.Si.
	Head of the Health Department of Baubau City.	dr. Lukman,Sp.pd
	Head of the Manpower Department of Baubau City.	Mursiddin,S.Sos.
	Head of the Environmental Department of Baubau City.	Halfia.A.Pi.,M.Pd.
	Head of the Fire and Rescue Department of Baubau City.	Muhammad Massad,SE.,M.Si.
	Head of the Cooperatives, Small and Medium Enterprises Department of Baubau City.	Fanti Frida Yanti,S.S.,MA.
	Head of the Housing, Residential Areas and Land Department of Baubau City.	Laode Nasrun,ST.,M.T.
	Head of the Civil Service Police Unit of Baubau City.	Samsuddin,S.Pd.
2023	Head of the Regional Development Planning Agency of Baubau City.	Dr. Dahrul Dahlan,S.STP.,M.Si.
	Head of the Transportation Agency of Baubau City.	Arlis,S.Pd.,M.Si
2024	Inspector of Baubau City.	Amrin Abdullah,S.Sos.,M.Si.
	Head of the Education and Culture Agency of Baubau City.	Eko Prasetya,ST.,MM.
	Head of the Population Control and Family Planning Agency of Baubau City.	Fanti Frida Yanti,S.S.,MA.

Source: Data Processed by Researchers

Based on the table, it can be seen that the names recommended by the selection committee in terms of education are on average 3 people with Masters and Doctoral degrees and one person with Bachelor's degrees. In terms of educational quality, it can be seen that the participants who passed have good capacity in terms of education. This is as conveyed by the selection team, namely Dr. Hj. Wa Ode Alzarliani, Chancellor of Muhammadiyah Buton University said that:

"We from the selection committee when conducting recruitment are truly professional, and those who took part in the selection during my time as a selection committee were indeed great, we also asked all of them and they could answer according to their

experience and knowledge of bureaucracy. In addition, there are achievements during their time as civil servants in Baubau City. and they have a very good level of education, some are bachelor's degrees, some have Masters degrees, some even have Doctorates. he said "

Based on the interview, it can be seen that the selection committee has worked as hard as possible to produce the best candidates according to the needs of the organization or the Baubau city government. However, from the names of the mayor's choices, of course, if we look at the instruments used by the mayor to determine the best candidate, it seems subjective. Because according to the author's observations, there is no single instrument used, either in the form of regulations or guidelines/instructions that are the basis for the mayor of Baubau to assess the 3 candidates so that one participant is selected who is truly the best candidate among all participants. Therefore, the Mayor's assessment is very subjective in determining one of the 3 candidates who will be inaugurated as an Echelon 2 official. The following will present a list of candidates who are relatives of the mayor of Baubau, deputy mayor of Baubau or other officials who have blood relations with policy makers.

Table 6. List of Family Relationships Between the Mayor/Secretary of Baubau City and Candidates for the Selection Results of High Leadership Positions in Baubau City From 2016-2024

Year	Auctioned Positions	Baubau Mayoral Election Candidates	Baubau Mayoral Election Candidates
2016	Head of the Culture and Tourism Office of Baubau City.	Drs. Ali Arham,M.MP	Nephew of Dr. H. A.S. Thamrin, M.H. (Mayor of Baubau)
2017	Regional Secretary of Baubau City.	Dr. Roni Muhtar,M.Pd	Nephew of Dr. H. A.S. Thamrin, M.H. (Mayor of Baubau)
2020	Head of the BKPSDM of Baubau City.	Abdul Rahman,S.Pd.,M.Si.	Nephew of Dr. H. A.S. Thamrin, M.H. (Mayor of Baubau)
	Head of the Fisheries Office of Baubau City.	Drs. Ruslan RZ.,M.Si	Friendship of Dr. H. A.S. Thamrin, M.H. (Mayor of Baubau)
	Head of the Food Security Office of Baubau City.	Ir. Wa Ode Muhibbah Suryani,M.Si.	Younger sibling of the Deputy Mayor of Baubau
	Head of the National Unity and Politics Agency of Baubau City.	Drs. Muhammad Amaludin,M.Si./	Family (In-law) Dr. Roni Mukhtar, M.Pd. Regional Secretary of Baubau City.
2022	Head of the Civil Service Police Unit of Baubau City.	Samsuddin,S.Pd./Tadir	Family/Cousin relationship with Mr. Monianse (Mayor of Baubau October 2022-2023)

Source: Data Processed by Researchers

Based on the table, it appears that the mayor of Baubau, in this case the civil service development officer, with his authority, can also determine relatives, nephews and family to be appointed as echelon 2 officials. Thus, the merit system with open selection for promotion to high-ranking positions still uses the spoil system.

Conclusion

Based on the research results and discussion, the conclusions in this study is determining the best candidate based on the merit system in the open selection of JPT (High Leadership Position) of the Baubau City Government from 2016 to 2023 has not sufficiently reflected the best candidate. This can be seen from the 3 stages of promotion of high leadership positions, namely the preparation stage, the implementation stage and the results stage. From the results of the study, there are several things that have caused the Merit System process with the Open Selection of Echelon II JPT Promotion to run well but have not produced the best candidate, namely; (1) Based on the research results, the participant's track record tracking has not used the Personnel Database or Data Base based on the Personnel Application. The instrument used for tracking track records in the merit system for the Promotion of high-ranking leaders is based on papers submitted to the committee to be presented in front of the selection committee; (2) The Public Test is not formatted by the Committee. So that the Public Test Sub-Stage Category is not included in the open selection committee schedule activities from 2016 to 2023, even though it is regulated in PermenPan RB Number 15 of 2019 concerning the Open and Competitive Filling of High-ranking Leaders in Government Agencies. It should be noted that the ASN Law does not and has not regulated the Public Test. In fact, the JPT Selection Technical Regulation does not explicitly regulate the Public Test; (3) From the research results. The purpose of the Merit system is to produce professional and competent apparatus through open selection, but relatives of the Mayor of Baubau and Deputy Mayor of Baubau are still found to occupy Echelon 2 positions (Spoil System). This was obtained based on data processed by researchers regarding the blood relationship between the Mayor of Baubau's policy makers, in this case the PPK (Personnel Development Officer) and the participants in the open selection for promotion to Echelon II positions in the Baubau City Government.

Suggestion

In line with this conclusion, the suggestions in this study are as follows; (1) Reviewing the current merit system so that it can become a representative system of merit principles; (2) Limiting the granting of discretionary authority by regional heads in selecting the best candidates by selecting based on regulations so as to avoid a spoil system in appointing the best candidates; (3) The importance of placing officials who have been promoted with educational backgrounds, competency levels, work experience, and personal characters that are appropriate while still prioritizing employees who are competent and expert in their fields because it greatly affects the process of government work output that can support the implementation of better regional development.

References

1. Abdul Sabaruddin & Puji Prio Utomo. 2021. Pelaksanaan Promosi Jabatan Berdasarkan Merit System Di Kabupaten Kolaka Dan Kota Kendari Provinsi Sulawesi Tenggara. Universitas Sembilanbelas November Kolaka, Indonesia. PUBLIK: Jurnal Manajemen Sumber Daya Manusia, Adminsitasi dan Pelayanan Publik Sekolah Tinggi Ilmu Administrasi Bina Taruna Gorontalo Volume VIII Nomor 2.
2. Agustino, Leo. (2014). Dasar- Dasar Kebijakan Publik. Bandung: CV. Alfabeta.
3. Albrow, M., 1970, Birokrasi (terjemahan), M. Rusli Karim dan Totok Daryanto, PT. Tiara Wacana, Yogyakarta
4. Aldana, E. C., Reyes, A. O. O., González, J. G., Gress, E. S. H., Acosta, C. R., & Acosta, O. C. (2018). Theoretical Foundation of a Human-TechnoStructural Model of Managerial Competences for the Public Transport of Dry Cargo. *American Journal of Industrial and Business Management*, 08(04), 1073–1092. <https://doi.org/10.4236/ajibm.2018.84074>.
5. Anastasya Anindita. 2019. Analisis Pengaruh Person Organization Fit Dan Person Job Fit Terhadap Kinerja Pegawai Melalui Komitmen Afektif. *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen (Jim)* Volume 8 Nomor 1 – Jurusan Manajemen Fakultas Ekonomi Universitas Negeri Surabaya
6. Ariswandy, D. 2021. Analisis Proses Seleksi Terbuka Jabatan Pimpinan Tinggi Pratama Pemerintah Kabupaten Pesawaran (Studi Kasus Penetapan JPTPTahun 2020). *Jurnal Ilmu Manajemen Saburai* Vol7 No.1, 11-26.
7. Atmojo, Muhammad Eko. 2016. Analisis Proses Promosi Jabatan Aparatur Sipil Negara Studi Kasus: Proses Promosi Jabatan Stuktural Eselon II di Pemerintah Daerah Daerah Istimewa Yogyakarta Tahun 2014. Program Studi Ilmu Pemerintahan Universitas Muhammadiyah Yogyakarta.
8. Aulawi, A. (2015). Penerapan Sistem Merit Dalam Manajemen ASN Dan Netralitas Asn Dari Unsur Politik Dalam Undangundang Aparatur Sipil Negara. *Jurnal RechtsVinding* , Media Pembinaan HukumNasional, 1–23.
9. Blau Peter M & Marshall W. Meyer, (2000) Alih bahasa oleh Slamet Rijanto, BirokrasiDalam Masyarakat Modern, Prestasi Pustakaraya, Jakarta.
10. Creswell JW. (2013). *Research Design Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Method Approaches* by John W. Creswell (z-lib.org).pdf (p. 265). Sage Publications. <https://id1lib.org/book/3700358/d95149>
11. Cushway, Barry, 1996, *Human Resources Mangement : The Fast Track MBA Series*. (terjemahan) Jakarta : PT. ElexMedia Komputindo.
12. McCourt, Willy. (2007). *The Merit System and Integrity in The Public Service*. IDPM, University of Manchester. No. 20